

**The Week That Was: 2013-11-30 (November 30, 2013)**  
**Brought to You by SEPP ([www.SEPP.org](http://www.SEPP.org))**  
**The Science and Environmental Policy Project**

#####

**Quote of the Week:** *Even then [18<sup>th</sup> century] it was clear to socially minded people that the openness of the possibilities was an opportunity, and that doubt and discussion were essential to progress into the unknown. If we want to solve a problem that we have never solved before, we must leave the door to the unknown ajar.* Richard Feynman, Value of Science

#####

**Number of the Week:** 11% v. 80%

#####

**PLEASE NOTE:** The SEPP web site have been hit by hackers. These are similar to the hackings to web sites of some high fashion retailers and to the web site of the US Health and Human Services Department. Those going to the SEPP web site have been redirected to web sites of Chinese products. We are working diligently to correct this situation. If you experience any difficulties please e-mail Ken@SEPP.org.

#####

**THIS WEEK:**

***By Ken Haapala, Executive Vice President, Science and Environmental Policy Project (SEPP)***

**Federal Funding:** The recent White House report on Federal Climate Changes Expenditures (budget authority) for Fiscal Year (FY) 2013, which ended on September 30, gave an opportunity for SEPP to update its calculations of total government expenditures since 1993 and to examine how these expenditures have changed during the 21 year period covered. These calculations are based on three government reports: 1) “Climate Change: Improvements Needed to Clarify National Priorities and better Align Them with Federal Funding Decisions” by the Government Accountability Office (GAO), May 2011, which covers the period from 1993 (calendar year) to FY 2010; 2) “Funding for Federal Climate Change Activities, FY 2008 to FY 2012, from the Congressional Research Service (CRS), April 26, 2012; and 3) Federal Climate Change Expenditures: Report to Congress by the White House, August 2013, which covers FY 2012 & 2013.

The GAO report gives both outlays by government agencies and special tax incentives to selected industries and activities. For ease of expression, the former can be considered hard expenditures, the latter can be considered soft expenditures, but they also include cash payments from the Treasury in lieu of tax credits and other tax preferences. The CRS report did not include the soft expenditures, and these were estimated previously from reports by the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS). The White House report gives both types of expenditures and serves as a cross check for the prior estimates for FY 2012.

As reported in prior TWTW’s, the GAO report shows a total of \$107 billion in hard expenditures, including about \$31.5 billion on climate science. These sums includes expenditures under American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 (Stimulus Bill). The GAO report also shows . an additional \$16 billion for soft expenditures. The CRS report shows \$8.9 billion and \$8.3 billion in hard expenditures in 2011 and 2012, respectively, of which \$2.4 billion went to climate science each year. The White House report shows that in 2012 soft expenditures amounted to about \$10.1 billion, roughly what was previously estimated. In 2013, total expenditures were \$22.2 billion, of which \$2.5 billion went to climate science, and about \$13.1 billion were soft expenditures.

The total for the 21-year period are: \$185 billion, with \$133 billion for hard expenditures, of which about \$39 billion went to science, and about \$52 billion for soft expenditures. The growth in soft expenditures in recent years has been staggering.

**In 1993, the US spent 54% of its climate change expenditures of \$2.4 billion on climate science, or \$1.3 billion; in 1999 it was 49% of \$3.5 billion, or \$1.7 billion; in 2009 it was 26% of 7.8 billion, or \$2 billion; and in 2013 it was 11% of \$22.2 billion, or \$2.5 billion. In short, increasing US climate change expenditures have not gone, primarily, to expanding knowledge of climate, but to special interests groups that have a keen interest in promoting fear of global warming/climate change, even if the science demonstrates global warming is not a serious concern.**

To understand the enormity of the diversion of funds away from addressing the global warming issue, it is useful to examine the principal components of 2013 funding. Of the total of \$22.2 billion in expenditures; 11% (\$2.5 billion) went to the US Global Change Research Program (the US science); 26% (\$5.8 billion) to Clean Energy Technology (developing alternatives to fossil fuels, or zero CO2 emissions); 4% (\$0.9 billion) to International Assistance, including funding of IPCC activities; 23% (\$5 billion) to Energy Tax Provisions That May Reduce Greenhouse Gases (tax breaks for special interests and activities); and 36% (\$8.1 billion) to Energy Payments in Lieu of Tax Provisions (cash payments to special groups such as developers of wind power). The last two categories account for the \$13.1 billion in soft expenditures and are more than the \$11 billion the National Institutes of Health spent on clinical research of known diseases and other human health issues. **Clearly, there is something very wrong with the Federal government's funding priorities.**

The world is no longer warming, but it may begin at any time. However, there is a great, and growing, disparity between the warming projected by the climate models and what is being observed. If this disparity continues to grow, the public will eventually recognized that it has been misled about the dangers of global warming. Given their past performance, government-funded climate scientists will attempt to pass the blame onto others. Yet, these scientists expressed great certainty in their work, a certainty that was unsupported by the science, and failed to publicly disclose significant errors such as the missing "hot spot" and the discredited hockey-stick. They are responsible for laying the foundation of the fear of global warming that heavily-funded opportunists are exploiting. See links to the reports under Funding Issues.

\*\*\*\*\*

**AMS:** Headed by Joseph D'Aleo of WeatherBell Analytics, a small group of Fellows of the American Meteorological Society (AMS) have been leading a quiet rebellion against the AMS leadership for issuing a statement that human emissions of carbon dioxide (CO2) are causing unprecedented and dangerous global warming and/or climate change. The statement was issued under the guise of contributing to the government policy process. It is rather strange for a science society to become involved in the policy process, unless it is to advocate solid, empirical science. Otherwise, the Society could be accused of participating in the misallocation of government funding presented above.

Some privately-funded advocacy groups, such as Forecast the Facts, are using the statement in an effort to force television meteorologists to accept the global warming orthodoxy and are calling for the de-certification or removal of television meteorologists who express skepticism of the dangers of CO2. These actions further illustrate the dangers to a science society that issues a view

on a heavily debated issue, such as global warming, that is not embraced by all the members of the society.

Recently, the AMS announced a survey taken in January that clearly shows that there is no consensus. Supposedly, the survey went to all members, yet D'Aleo provided SEPP with a list of noted members, skeptics, who were not surveyed. Had they been surveyed the non-consensus would have been closer to 50-50.

The headline by Forecast the Facts was: "Weathercaster Survey Shows Need For Public Action Against Climate Denial." Its press release states: "Join our ongoing campaign to end global-warming denial by our nation's television weathercasters." All this is part of the program of global warming advocates to communicate better with the public, whatever it takes.

Perhaps one big difference between broadcast meteorologists and climatologists is that, within a few days, broadcast meteorologists will be informed by nature, and the public, if their forecasts are very wrong. Insulated by government funding, climatologists have been ignoring that, for over a decade, nature has been informing them their forecasts are very wrong.

Let us hope that the team led by D'Aleo, and similar groups, continue in their efforts to persuade the leadership of the AMS that the path it has chosen is contrary to the best interests of science. See links under Seeking a Common Ground and for the press release by Forecast the Facts see link under Communicating Better with the Public—Go Personal.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Doubt:** Judith Curry has an interesting post discussing uncertainty in science in general and climate science in particular. However, the lecture by Richard Feynman on the Value of Science, with its emphasis on the importance of doubt, is more provocative. Please see link under Seeking a Common Ground, the Quote of the Week and from the past few TWTWs.s

\*\*\*\*\*

**Number of the Week:** 11% v. 80% As stated in the Federal Funding section, in 2013 11% of Federal expenditures on climate change went to climate science. According to the National Institutes of Health, 80% of its budget went to research. The disparity further illustrates the distortions in funding that is occurring under the guise of climate change.

#####

### **ARTICLES:**

For the numbered articles below please see this week's TWTW at: [www.sepp.org](http://www.sepp.org). The articles are at the end of the pdf.

#### **1. New Zealand Court Rejects 'Climate Change' Refugee**

Justice Calls Pacific Islander's Claim 'Novel' but Insufficient

By Lucy Craymer, WSJ, Nov 26, 2013

<http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579221030617117194>

#### **2. Wind Power Is Brought to Justice**

Duke Energy's guilty plea for killing protected birds is an ominous sign for renewable energy

By Robert Bryce, WSJ, Nov 28, 2013

[http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579218260583305226?mod=WSJ\\_Opinion\\_LEFTTopOpinion](http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579218260583305226?mod=WSJ_Opinion_LEFTTopOpinion)

[SEPP Comment: When discussing cash payments to wind farms, the timing of the payment is when it is placed in service, rather than at the start of the project. Thus, even though starts were down in 2013, payments were high.]

#####

## **NEWS YOU CAN USE:**

### ***Science: Is the Sun Rising?***

#### **Grand Minimum of the Total Solar Irradiance Leads to the Little Ice Age**

By Habibullo Abdussamatov, SPPI, Nov 25, 2013

[http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/originals/grand\\_minimum\\_of\\_the\\_total\\_solar\\_irradiance\\_leads\\_to\\_the\\_little\\_ice\\_age.html](http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/originals/grand_minimum_of_the_total_solar_irradiance_leads_to_the_little_ice_age.html)

Link to report:

[http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/images/stories/papers/originals/grand\\_minimum.pdf](http://scienceandpublicpolicy.org/images/stories/papers/originals/grand_minimum.pdf)

### ***Commentary: Is the Sun Rising?***

#### **Calm solar cycle prompts questions about impact on Earth**

By Staff Writers, Washington (AFP), Nov 25, 2013

[http://www.spacedaily.com/reports/Calm\\_solar\\_cycle\\_prompts\\_questions\\_about\\_impact\\_on\\_Earth\\_999.html](http://www.spacedaily.com/reports/Calm_solar_cycle_prompts_questions_about_impact_on_Earth_999.html)

[SEPP Comment: Global warming will prevent any future ice age? If true, it would be a powerful argument for the social benefits of carbon.]

### ***Climategate Continued***

#### **Bristlecone Addiction in Shi et al 2013**

By Steve McIntyre, Climate Audit, Nov 28, 2013

<http://climateaudit.org/2013/11/28/bristlecone-addiction-in-shi-et-al-2013/#more-18641>

But the main problem is the longstanding one: if you take a small subpopulation of hockey-stick shaped bristlecones and mix them with a population of “proxies” that are indistinguishable from white noise/red noise and apply typical multiproxy recipes, you will get back a HS-shaped reconstruction.

### ***Challenging the Orthodoxy***

#### **Vincent Gray's Comments to the IPCC WG1 AR5 Second Draft**

By Vincent Gray, NZ Climate Truth Newsletter No 322, Nov 27, 2013

<http://theclimatescepticsparty.blogspot.com.au/2013/11/vincent-grays-comments-to-ipcc-wg1-ar5.html>

#### **Expert Reviewer Prof S. Fred Singer's Comments on the Second-Order Draft of the Climate Science Working Group (WG1) to the Fifth Assessment Report (AR5, 2013)**

By Vincent Gray, NZ Climate Truth Newsletter No. 323, Nov 29, 2013

<http://theclimatescepticsparty.blogspot.com.au/2013/11/expert-reviewer-prof-s-fred-singers.html>

#### **Expert Reviewer Lord Christopher Monckton's Comments on the Second-Order Draft of the Contribution of the Climate Science Working Group (WG1) to the Fifth Assessment Report (AR5, 2013)**

By Vincent Gray, NZ Climate Truth Newsletter No. 323, Nov 29, 2013

<http://theclimatescepticsparty.blogspot.com.au/2013/11/expert-reviewer-lord-christopher.html>

**New paper rules out volcanoes as the cause of the 'pause'**

By Staff Writer, The Hockey Schtick, Nov 25, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://hockeyschtick.blogspot.co.uk/2013/11/new-paper-rules-out-volcanoes-as-cause.html>

Link to Paper: The impact of volcanic eruptions in the period 2000–2013 on global mean temperature trends evaluated in the HadGEM2-ES climate model

By Haywood, Jones, and Jones, Atmospheric Science Letters, Nov 25, 2013

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/asl2.471/abstract>

### **Real pollution (not ‘carbon’ pollution) increases storm clouds**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 26, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/26/real-pollution-not-carbon-pollution-increases-storm-clouds/>

### ***Defending the Orthodoxy***

#### **Bloomberg weighs 2014 climate battles**

By Ben Geman, The Hill, Nov 26, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/e2-wire/e2-wire/191485-bloomberg-weighs-2014-climate-battles>

### **The Coming Heat Age**

Wu Changhua is Greater China Director of The Climate Group, Project Syndicate, Nov 28, 2013

<http://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/changhua-wu-recommends-three-measures-to-limit-global-warming-by-2100>

### ***Questioning the Orthodoxy***

#### **Darwin’s Mistakes**

By Vincent Gray, NZ Climate Truth Newsletter No 321

<http://theclimatescepticsparty.blogspot.com.au/2013/11/darwins-mistakes.html>

### **The Important Difference between Climatology and Climate Science**

Why did the Royal Society need secret meetings?

By Tim Ball, WUWT, Nov 29, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/29/the-important-difference-between-climatology-and-climate-science/>

### **How to avoid the nine most terrifying words in the English language**

By Anthony Sadar, Washington Examiner, Nov 29, 2013

<http://washingtonexaminer.com/how-to-avoid-the-nine-most-terrifying-words-in-the-english-language/article/2539943>

### **A Climate of Fear, Cash and Correctitude**

By Paul Driessen and Dennis Mitchell, Townhall, Nov 23, 2013

<http://townhall.com/columnists/pauldriessen/2013/11/23/a-climate-of-fear-cash-and-correctitude-n1751551>

### **The UN Global Warming Hoax is Slowly Dying**

By Alan Caruba, Warning Signs, Nov 25, 2013

<http://factsnotfantasy.blogspot.com/2013/11/the-un-global-warming-hoax-is-slowly.html>

### **Five Myths About the "Carbon Asset Bubble"**

By Geoffrey Styles, Energy Outlook, Nov 22, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://energyoutlook.blogspot.co.uk/2013/11/five-myths-about-carbon-asset-bubble.html>

### ***Climate Circus***

#### **COP 19**

By Donn Dears, Power for USA, Nov 29, 2013

<http://dddusmma.wordpress.com/2013/11/29/cop-19/>

#### **UN Climate Talks: Beyond Farce**

By John Hinderaker, Power Line, Nov 23, 2013

<http://www.powerlineblog.com/archives/2013/11/un-climate-talks-beyond-farce.php>

#### **Global Warming Activism: Another Year, Another U.N. Flop**

By Patrick Michaels, Forbes, Nov 24, 2013

<http://www.forbes.com/sites/patrickmichaels/2013/11/24/global-warming-activism-another-year-another-u-n-flop/>

#### **UN Climate Fanatics**

According to Ban Ki-moon, the latest IPCC report vaporized climate skepticism.

By Donna Faframboise, NFC, Nov 23, 2013

<http://nofrackingconsensus.com/2013/11/29/un-climate-fanatics/>

#### **UN climate delegates failing everyone**

By Tom Harris and Madhav Khandekar, On Line Opinion, Nov 25, 2013

<http://www.onlineopinion.com.au/view.asp?article=15746&page=0>

*[SEPP Comment: Except those who profit from the circus.]*

#### **The Good Word from Warsaw**

As Australia slept on Sunday morning, confident of an Ashes win, players in another game on the opposite side of the world were trying frantically to snatch victory from the ashes of defeat

By Michael Kile, Quadrant, Nov 25, 2013

<http://quadrant.org.au/opinion/doomed-planet/2013/11/good-word-warsaw/>

#### **Pollution Pact From China to India Shows Rift: Carbon & Climate**

By Reed Landberg & Alex Morales, Bloomberg, Nov 24, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2013-11-25/pollution-pact-from-china-to-india-shows-rift-carbon-climate.html>

#### **Change of Wording Lets Emerging Nations Off the Hook Over CO2 Emissions**

By Ben Webster, Times, Via GWPF, Nov 25, 2013

<http://www.thegwgf.org/change-wording-lets-developing-nations-hook-co2-emissions/>

### ***Problems in the Orthodoxy***

#### **Staggering Concessions By Austria's National Weather Service: "Natural Factors Substantial...Models Inadequate"!**

By P Gosselin, No Tricks Zone, Nov 27, 2013

<http://notrickszone.com/2013/11/27/staggering-concessions-by-austrias-national-weather-service-natural-factors-substantial-models-inadequate/>

#### **China's "Emission Cuts" Not What They Seem**

By Paul Homewood, UWUT, Nov 24, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/24/chinas-emission-cuts-not-what-they-seem/>

### ***Seeking a Common Ground***

#### **Meteorologists' views about global warming: A survey of American Meteorological Society professional**

By Staff Writer, ICECAP, Nov 26, 2013

[http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/meteorologists\\_views\\_about\\_global\\_warming\\_a\\_survey\\_of\\_american\\_meteorologic/](http://icecap.us/index.php/go/joes-blog/meteorologists_views_about_global_warming_a_survey_of_american_meteorologic/)

Link to early release: Meteorologists' views about global warming: A survey of American Meteorological Society professional members

By Neil Stenhouse, Edward Maibach, Sara Cobb, George Mason Univ. No Date

<http://journals.ametsoc.org/doi/pdf/10.1175/BAMS-D-13-00091.1>

In a survey of American Meteorological Society members, perceived scientific consensus was the strongest predictor of global warming views, followed by political ideology, climate science expertise and perceived organizational conflict.

#### **Warsaw Loss and Damage Mechanism: A climate for corruption?**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 24, 2013

<http://judithcurry.com/2013/11/24/warsaw-loss-and-damage-mechanism-a-climate-for-corruption/>

*[SEPP Comment: Bangladesh provides a major example of rewarding countries for natural disasters. How much sea level rise is actual land subsidence rather than sea level rise from increasing temperatures? If temperatures do not increase, do the donor countries get the money back?]*

#### **Impact (?) of natural variability on Nebraska drought**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 29, 2013

<http://judithcurry.com/2013/11/29/impact-of-natural-variability-on-nebraska-drought/#more-13918>

*[SEPP Comment: Curry suggesting she would take on a Nebraska study that climate scientists in Nebraska would not.]*

#### **Code Blue in the Greenhouse:**

Darwall tells how it was conservative governments who were the first to raise the alarm.

By Bernie Lewin, Enthusiasm, Scepticism and Science, Nov 17, 2013

<http://enthusiasmscepticismscience.wordpress.com/2013/11/17/code-blue-in-the-greenhouse/#more-1373>

*[SEPP Comment: A lengthy discussion on the origins of the global warming fears.]*

### ***Lowering Standards***

#### **Pacific faces big economic losses from climate change: ADB**

By Staff Writers, Sydney (AFP), Nov 26, 2013

[http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Pacific\\_faces\\_big\\_economic\\_losses\\_from\\_climate\\_change\\_AD\\_B\\_999.html](http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Pacific_faces_big_economic_losses_from_climate_change_AD_B_999.html)

*[SEPP Comment: More non-science from the Asian Development Bank.]*

### ***Expanding the Orthodoxy***

#### **UN sounds alarm over ozone-damaging nitrous oxide**

By Staff Writers, Warsaw (AFP), Nov 21, 2013

[http://www.terraily.com/reports/UN\\_sounds\\_alarm\\_over\\_ozone-damaging\\_nitrous\\_oxide\\_999.html](http://www.terraily.com/reports/UN_sounds_alarm_over_ozone-damaging_nitrous_oxide_999.html)

[SEPP Comment: New fears as old ones are fading?]

### **Questioning European Green**

#### **A very slow motion car crash**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 23, 2013

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2013/11/23/a-very-slow-motion-car-crash.html>

[SEPP Comment: Time to emigrate?]

#### **Energy-saving schemes 'failing despite £8.4bn pricetag'**

Energy efficiency schemes are failing despite their £8.4bn price-tag while take-up of Green Deal insulation programme is running at less than 1pc of target, according to studies.

By Emily Gosden, and Steve Hawkes, Telegraph, UK, Nov 27, 2013

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/finance/newsbysector/energy/10476818/Energy-saving-schemes-failing-despite-8.4bn-pricetag.html>

#### **Developers pull the plug on one of the world's largest offshore windfarms**

Plans for the Atlantic Array, just off the coast of North Devon, have been abandoned by German-owned developers RWE npower

By Hayley Dixon, Telegraph, UK, Nov 26, 2013

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/earth/energy/windpower/10474562/Developers-pull-the-plug-on-one-of-the-worlds-largest-offshore-windfarms.html>

#### **UK Energy Doldrums Kill Massive Wind Farm**

By Walter Russell Mead, Via Media, Nov 27, 2013

<http://blogs.the-american-interest.com/wrm/2013/11/27/uk-energy-doldrums-kill-massive-wind-farm/>

#### **Union and SPD bury Germany's energy transition**

It is only one sentence in the coalition agreement, but it could mean the end of Germany's green energy shift (Energiewende). The Christian Democrats (CDU) and Social Democrats (SPD) want to force the renewable industry to pay for conventional back-up energy generation.

By Fritz Vorholz, Trans. Philipp Mueller, De Zeit, Nov 22, 2013

<http://www.windaction.org/posts/39151-union-and-spd-bury-germany-s-energy-transition#.UpOcb8SbPT8>

This [decisive statement] refers to the cardinal problem of solar and wind energy, the intermittency of power generation that depends on the weather. The year has 8,760 hours; wind turbines, however, only produce for 1,530 hours at full power, photovoltaic systems even just for 980 hours. To make matters worse, no one knows in advance when green electricity is fed into the grid, and when it's not available.

[SEPP Comment: The above numbers work out to full power from wind 17% of the time and from solar 11% of the time – and it is still unreliable.]

#### **Behind the windfarm scenes**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 26, 2013

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2013/11/26/behind-the-windfarm-scenes.html>

[SEPP Comment: A recording on the problems in maintenance of wind farms. In Northern Europe icing is a major problem. A 21 day ice-up forces questioning of investing in wind farms.]

## **Germany Sets Out Plan to Rein in Surging Energy Costs**

By Henning Gloystein and Christoph Steitz, Reuters, Nov 27, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/11/27/us-germany-coalition-energy-idUSBRE9AQ0WJ20131127>

## **German Auto Makers' Finances Could Be Wrecked By Energy Policy**

By Neil Winton, Forbes, Nov 25, 2013

<http://www.forbes.com/sites/neilwinton/2013/11/25/german-auto-makers-finances-could-be-wrecked-by-energy-policy/>

## ***Funding Issues***

### **Climate Change: Improvements Needed to Clarify National Priorities and Better Align Them with Federal Funding Decisions**

By Staff Writers, Summary, GAO-11-317, May 20, 2011 [H/t Timothy Wise]

<http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-11-317>

### **Funding for Federal Climate Change Activities FY 2008 to FY 2012**

By Jane Leggett, CRS, Apr 26, 2013

[http://www.epw.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?FuseAction=Files.View&FileStore\\_id=91e9fae6-083a-44f6-b47c-33fdac25d6e0](http://www.epw.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?FuseAction=Files.View&FileStore_id=91e9fae6-083a-44f6-b47c-33fdac25d6e0)

### **Federal Climate Change Expenditures: Report to Congress**

The White House, August 2013

[http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/assets/legislative\\_reports/fcce-report-to-congress.pdf](http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/assets/legislative_reports/fcce-report-to-congress.pdf)

### **Britain's Bill for Climate Aid Rises to £4.5 Billion**

By Richard Gray, Daily Telegraph, Via GWPF, Nov 24, 2013

<http://www.thegwpf.org/britains-bill-climate-aid-rises-4-5-billion/>

## ***Communicating Better to the Public – Exaggerate, or be Vague?***

### **Even if emissions stop, carbon dioxide could warm Earth for centuries**

By Staff Writers, Princeton NJ (SPX), Nov 26, 2013

[http://www.terraily.com/reports/Even\\_if\\_emissions\\_stop\\_carbon\\_dioxide\\_could\\_warm\\_Earth\\_for\\_centuries\\_999.html](http://www.terraily.com/reports/Even_if_emissions_stop_carbon_dioxide_could_warm_Earth_for_centuries_999.html)

## ***Communicating Better to the Public – Make things up.***

### **The IPCC goes for video bling (and CGI enhanced doom)**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 23, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/23/the-ipcc-goes-for-video-bling-and-cgi-enhanced-doom/>

*[SEPP Comment: When you cannot make the scientific argument, resort to propaganda claiming you did. Invisible CO2 blackening the skies is black propaganda!]*

### **One-Sided IPCC Alarmism Promotion Video Already Receiving Harsh Criticism...Scientists Purporting To Be Prophets**

By P Gosselin, No Tricks Zone, Nov 23, 2013

<http://notrickszone.com/2013/11/23/one-sided-ipcc-alarmism-promotion-video-already-receiving-harsh-criticism/>

*[SEPP Comment: See link immediately above. Harsh criticism from members of the orthodoxy.]*

### **Sea level rise could exceed one meter in this century**

By Staff Writers, Potsdam, Germany (SPX), Nov 29, 2013

[http://www.terraily.com/reports/Sea\\_level\\_rise\\_could\\_exceed\\_one\\_meter\\_in\\_this\\_century\\_999.html](http://www.terraily.com/reports/Sea_level_rise_could_exceed_one_meter_in_this_century_999.html)

Link to paper: Expert assessment of sea-level rise by AD 2100 and AD 2300

By Horton, Rahmstorf, Engelhart, and Kemp, Quaternary Science Reviews, Jan 15, 2013

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0277379113004381>

*[SEPP Comment: All based on computer models no one has bothered to validate.]*

### **Polar bear researchers – are they protecting the bears or their own jobs?**

By Susan Crockford, Polar Bear Science, Nov 25, 2013

<http://polarbearscience.com/2013/11/25/polar-bear-researchers-are-they-protecting-the-bears-or-their-own-jobs/>

### **Polar bear researchers still withholding Hudson Bay data**

By Susan Crockford, Polar Bear Science, Nov 28, 2013

<http://polarbearscience.com/2013/11/28/polar-bear-researchers-still-withholding-hudson-bay-data/>

*[SEPP Comment: May be the answer to the above link.]*

### ***Communicating Better to the Public – Go Personal.***

#### **Weathercaster Survey Shows Need For Public Action Against Climate Denial**

By Staff Writer, Forecast the Facts, Nov 27, 2013

<http://forecastthefacts.org/press/releases/2013/11/27/weathercaster-survey-shows-need-public-action-agai/>

### ***Models Issues***

#### **Reflection on reliability of climate models**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 25, 2013

<http://judithcurry.com/2013/11/25/reflection-on-reliability-of-climate-models/>

#### **Social cost of carbon: Part II**

By Judith Curry, Climate Etc. Nov 27, 2013

<http://judithcurry.com/2013/11/27/social-cost-of-carbon-part-ii/>

#### **Study: lack of cloud physics biased climate models high**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 29, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/29/study-lack-of-cloud-physics-biased-climate-models-high/>

#### **New paper demonstrates inability to model clouds**

By Staff Writer, Hockey Schtick, Nov 28, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://hockeyschtick.blogspot.co.uk/2013/11/new-paper-demonstrates-inability-to.html>

*[SEPP Comment: Confirming what has been known.]*

### ***Measurement Issues***

#### **A Survey Of The Perceptions Of Climate Scientists 2013: No Consensus**

By Matt Briggs, His Blog, Nov 25, 2013

<http://wmbriggs.com/blog/?p=10150>

## **GISS Ground Based Versus Satellite Temperatures**

By Ed Caryl, No Tricks Zone, Nov 28, 2013

<http://notrickszone.com/2013/11/28/data-comparison-shows-giss-arctic-winter-temperature-trend-grossly-overblown-arctic-data-contaminated-flawed/>

## **GISS Data Confirm Winters Definitely Getting Colder Over Northern Hemisphere Continents Since 1995!**

Are Winters Getting Colder?

By Ed Caryl, No Tricks Zone, Nov 24, 2013

<http://notrickszone.com/2013/11/24/giss-data-confirm-winters-definitely-getting-colder-over-northern-hemisphere-continents-since-1995/>

## **New study determines more accurate method to date tropical glacier moraines**

By Staff Writers, Hanover NH (SPX), Nov 25, 2013

[http://www.terradaily.com/reports/New\\_study\\_determines\\_more\\_accurate\\_method\\_to\\_date\\_tropical\\_glacier\\_moraines\\_999.html](http://www.terradaily.com/reports/New_study_determines_more_accurate_method_to_date_tropical_glacier_moraines_999.html)

## ***Changing Weather***

### **New Report Concludes that Extreme Weather Events Are Not Increasing**

By Staff Writers, GWPF, Nov 27, 2013

<http://www.thegwpf.org/report-concludes-extreme-weather-events-increasing/>

Link to the report: The Global Warming-Extreme Weather Link

By Madhav Khandekar, GWPF, Nov 27, 2013

<http://www.thegwpf.org/content/uploads/2013/11/Khandekar-Extreme-Weather.pdf>

## **2013: slowest Atlantic hurricane season in 30 years**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 25, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/25/2013-slowest-hurricane-season-in-30-years/>

## **Extreme Weather 'Not Linked To Climate Change'**

By Jared Owens, The Australian, Via GWPF, Nov 29, 2013

<http://www.thegwpf.org/extreme-weather-not-linked-climate-change/>

## **Philippines typhoon death toll feared to hit 7,000**

By Staff Writers, Tacloban, Philippines (AFP) Nov 23, 2013

[http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Philippines\\_typhoon\\_death\\_toll\\_feared\\_to\\_hit\\_7000\\_999.html](http://www.terradaily.com/reports/Philippines_typhoon_death_toll_feared_to_hit_7000_999.html)

## ***Changing Climate***

### **Greenland's Shrunken Ice Sheet: We've Been Here Before**

By Staff Writers, Science Daily, Nov 22, 2013 [H/t Anne Debeil]

[http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2013/11/131122165523.htm?utm\\_source=feedburner&utm\\_medium=email&utm\\_campaign=Feed%3A+sciencedaily%2Ftop\\_news%2Ftop\\_environment+%28ScienceDaily%3A+Top+News+--+Top+Environment%29](http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2013/11/131122165523.htm?utm_source=feedburner&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+sciencedaily%2Ftop_news%2Ftop_environment+%28ScienceDaily%3A+Top+News+--+Top+Environment%29)

## ***Changing Cryosphere – Land / Sea Ice***

### **Early-career investigator discovers current volcanic activity under West Antarctica**

By Staff Writers, Washington DC (SPX), Nov 25, 2013

[http://www.terraily.com/reports/Early\\_career\\_investigator\\_discovers\\_current\\_volcanic\\_activity\\_under\\_West\\_Antarctica\\_999.html](http://www.terraily.com/reports/Early_career_investigator_discovers_current_volcanic_activity_under_West_Antarctica_999.html)

### **The Strange "Global Warming" of the Antarctic Peninsula**

By Sherwood, Keith and Craig Idso, CO2 Science, Nov 27, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.co2science.org/articles/V16/N48/EDIT.php>

[SEPP Comment: The low temperatures have become warmer but not the high temperatures.]

### **Lakes discovered beneath Greenland ice sheet**

Posted by Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 27, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/27/lakes-discovered-beneath-greenland-ice-sheet/>

Link to paper: Greenland subglacial lakes detected by radar†

By Palmer, et al, GRL, Nov 25, 2013

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/2013GL058383/abstract>

### **Study: Arctic seafloor methane releases double previous estimates**

By Marmian Grimes, Univ of Alaska, Nov 24, 2013 [H/t WUWT]

<http://uafornerstone.net/ESAS2013/>

### ***Changing Earth***

#### **Amber Provides New Insights Into the Evolution of the Earth's Atmosphere**

By Staff Writers, Innsbruck, Austria (SPX), Nov 22, 2013

[http://www.terraily.com/reports/Amber\\_Provides\\_New\\_Insights\\_Into\\_the\\_Evolution\\_of\\_the\\_Earths\\_Atmosphere\\_999.html](http://www.terraily.com/reports/Amber_Provides_New_Insights_Into_the_Evolution_of_the_Earths_Atmosphere_999.html)

Link to paper: Stable carbon isotopes of C3 plant resins and ambers record changes in atmospheric oxygen since the Triassic

By Tappert, et al, Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, Nov 15, 2013

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0016703713003906>

### ***Agriculture Issues & Fear of Famine***

#### **World agricultural output continues to rise, despite predictions of decline**

By Steve Goreham, Washington Times, Nov 26, 2013

<http://communities.washingtontimes.com/neighborhood/climatism-watching-climate-science/2013/nov/26/world-agricultural-output-continues-rise-despite-p/>

Link to report: World Agricultural Supply and Demand Estimates

By Staff Writers, Office of the Chief Economist, USDA, Nov 8, 2013

<http://usda01.library.cornell.edu/usda/current/wasde/wasde-11-08-2013.pdf>

### ***Review of Recent Scientific Articles by NIPCC***

***For a full list of articles see [www.NIPCCreport.org](http://www.NIPCCreport.org)***

#### **Responses of Marine Benthic Microalgae to Declining pH Values**

Reference: Johnson, V.R., Brownlee, C., Rickaby, R.E.M., Graziano, M., Milazzo, M. and Hall-Spencer, J.M. 2013. Responses of marine benthic microalgae to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Marine Biology* 160: 1813-1824.

<http://nipccreport.org/articles/2013/nov/26nov2013a1.html>

... stimulation of biomass in benthic assemblages was found to increase fivefold along a natural gradient of CO<sub>2</sub> ranging from 419 to 1611 ppm

### **Fine-Tuning the Spatial Distributions of Species' Thermal Habitats**

Reference: Lenoir, J., Graae, B.J., Aarrestad, P.A., Alsos, I.G., Armbruster, W.S., Austrheim, G., Bergendorff, C., Birks, H.J.B., Brathen, K.A., Brunet, J.O., Bruun, H.H., Dahlberg, C.J., Decocq, G., Diekmann, M., Dynesius, M., Aes, R.E., Grytnes, J.-A., Hylander, K., Anderud, K., Luoto, M., Milbau, A., Moora, M., Nygaard, B., Odland, A., Ravolainen, V.T., Reinhardt, S., Sandvik, S.M., Schei, F.H., Speed, J.D.M., Tveraabak, L.U., Vandvik, V., Velle, L.G., Virtanen, R., Zobel, M. and Svenning, J.-C. 2013. Local temperatures inferred from plant communities suggest strong spatial buffering of climate warming across Northern Europe. *Global Change Biology* 19: 1470-1481. <http://nipccreport.org/articles/2013/nov/26nov2013a2.html>

### **Elevated CO2 Reduces Ceratocystis Wilt in Two Eucalyptus Clones**

Reference: Dos Santos, M. de S., Ghini, R., Fernandes, B.V. and Silva, C.A. 2013. Increased carbon dioxide concentration in the air reduces the severity of Ceratocystis wilt in Eucalyptus clonal plantlets. *Australasian Plant Pathology* 42: 595-599. <http://nipccreport.org/articles/2013/nov/27nov2013a1.html>

### **Modeling the West African Monsoon**

Reference: Roehrig, R., Bouniol, D., Guichard, F., Hourdin, F. and Redelsperger, J.-L. 2013. The present and future of the West African Monsoon: A process-oriented assessment of CMIP5 simulations along the AMMA transect. *Journal of Climate* 26: 6471-6505. <http://nipccreport.org/articles/2013/nov/27nov2013a2.html>

### ***The Political Games Continue***

#### **Property rights and climate change**

By Anthony Flint, Virginia Pilot, Nov 24, 2013 [H/t Timothy Wise]

<http://hamptonroads.com/2013/11/property-rights-and-climate-change>

[SEPP Comment: More reason to be leery about government-funded climate science.]

### ***Cap-and-Trade and Carbon Taxes***

#### **Typhoons & Carbon Taxes; Tragic, but not our fault.**

By Viv Forbes & Helpers, The Carbon Sense Coalition, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thelimatescepticsparty.blogspot.com.au/2013/11/typhoons-carbon-taxes-tragic-but-not.html>

### ***EPA and other Regulators on the March***

#### **EPA taps green group scientist for ‘integrity’ position**

By Ben Geman, The Hill, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/e2-wire/e2-wire/191371-epa-taps-green-group-scientist-for-integrity-position>

#### **In the mood for some nice government-speak? EPA appoints new “Scientific Integrity Official”**

By Staff Writers, ACSH, Nov 27, 2013

<http://acsh.org/2013/11/mood-nice-government-speak-epa-appoints-new-scientific-integrity-official/>

#### **House GOP: Last Laugh on “Carbon Pollution Rule”?**

By Marlo Lewis, Global Warming.org, Nov 22, 2013 [H/t Jim Wallace]

<http://www.globalwarming.org/2013/11/22/house-gop-last-laugh-on-carbon-pollution-rule/>

*[SEPP Comment: According to the report, in stating a technology is commercially available, regulators cannot use facilities built with Federal funds. If true, the commercially questionable carbon capture and storage facilities the EPA cited do not qualify.]*

### **Feds reveal data behind ‘social cost of carbon’**

By Julian Hattam, The Hill, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/regwatch/energyenvironment/191338-feds-publish-social-cost-of-carbon-document>

Link to Technical Support Document as revised in November 2013

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/assets/inforeg/technical-update-social-cost-of-carbon-for-regulator-impact-analysis.pdf>

*[SEPP Comment: Fails to identify a climate model with predictive capability. Without one, the products of all three integrated assessment models (IAM) are nothing but speculation. Comment period ends 60 days after publication in the Federal Register.]*

### **DOE proposes new efficiency standards for electric motors**

By Laura Barron-Lopez, The Hill, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/e2-wire/e2-wire/191394-energy-dept-proposes-new-efficiency-regs-for-electric-motors>

Link to the announcement: Energy Conservation Program: Energy Conservation: Standards for Commercial and Industrial Electric Motors

By Staff Writers, DOE, No date

[http://www1.eere.energy.gov/buildings/appliance\\_standards/pdfs/electric\\_motors\\_ecs\\_nopr.pdf](http://www1.eere.energy.gov/buildings/appliance_standards/pdfs/electric_motors_ecs_nopr.pdf)

*[SEPP Comment: The estimate for the monetary benefit of CO2 reduction is between \$2.5 and \$36.6 billion, pp 18, 19, 246-252]*

### **Park Service withdraws its objection to fracking; used op-ed instead of scientific evidence**

By Stephen Dian, Washington Times, Nov 26, 2013

<http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2013/nov/26/park-service-withdraws-its-objection-to-fracking/>

... have cited a New York Times op-ed as scientific evidence.

### **White House climate ‘resilience’ group gets rolling**

By Ben Geman, The Hill, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/e2-wire/e2-wire/191351-white-house-climate-resilience-group-gets-rolling>

### ***Energy Issues – Non-US***

#### **Counting the cost**

By Andrew Montford, Bishop Hill, Nov 29, 2013

<http://bishophill.squarespace.com/blog/2013/11/29/counting-the-cost.html>

*[SEPP Comment: Arguing who will benefit from the development of gas from shale in the UK even before successful wells have been drilled!]*

### **Big Oil, Big-Gas lobby against coal. Shell leans on World Bank to nobble the competition**

By Jo Nova, Her Blog, Nov 29, 2013

<http://joannenova.com.au/2013/11/big-oil-big-gas-lobby-against-coal-shell-leans-on-world-bank-to-nobble-the-competition/#more-31990>

## **Oil Sands and the Environment – Part I**

By: Robert Rapier, Energy Tribune, Nov 25, 2013

<http://www.energytribune.com/79801/oil-sands-and-the-environment-part-i#sthash.0ILepZ3u.dpbs>

*[SEPP Comment: A wordy report with two major points. One, the loss of caribou may be more to wolves taking advantage of paths cleared for seismic surveying equipment rather than from any other cause. Two, the withdrawal of water during periods of low flow is more important than the annual withdrawal.]*

## ***Energy Issues -- US***

### **Price of Electricity Hit Record for October; Up 42% in Decade**

By Terence Jeffrey, CNS News, Nov 22, 2013

<http://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/terence-p-jeffrey/price-electricity-hit-record-october-42-decade>

From Consumer Price Index-Average Price Data

<http://data.bls.gov/cgi-bin/surveymost?ap>

### **Report: Methane emissions 50 percent higher than EPA estimates**

By Laura Barron-Lopez, The Hill, Nov 25, 2013

<http://thehill.com/blogs/e2-wire/e2-wire/191378-report-methane-emissions-50-percent-higher-than-epa-estimates>

## ***Oil and Natural Gas – the Future or the Past?***

### **Hydraulic Fracturing: Mature Technology, Modern Marvel**

By Mark Crawford, ASME, Nov 2013

[https://www.asme.org/engineering-topics/articles/fossil-power/hydraulic-fracturing-mature-technology-modern?cm\\_sp=Home-\\_-HomeContent-\\_-Hydraulic-Fracturing-Mature-Technology-Modern](https://www.asme.org/engineering-topics/articles/fossil-power/hydraulic-fracturing-mature-technology-modern?cm_sp=Home-_-HomeContent-_-Hydraulic-Fracturing-Mature-Technology-Modern)

### **Shale predicted to add £3 trillion to Europe's economies**

Study says fracking would dramatically reduce reliance on expensive energy imports and create a million new jobs.

By Bruno Waterfield, Telegraph, UK, Nov 25, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/finance/newsbysector/energy/oilandgas/10473418/Shale-could-add-3-trillion-to-Europes-economies.html>

### **The Frackers**

Review of a book on the people who made the shale gas revolution

By Matt Ridley, His Blog, Nov 25, 2013

<http://www.rationaloptimist.com/blog/the-frackers.aspx>

## ***Nuclear Energy and Fears***

### **Construction underway of second Vogtle AP1000**

By Staff Writers WNN, Nov 22, 2013

<http://www.world-nuclear-news.org/NN-Construction-underway-of-second-Vogtle-AP1000-2211134.html>

*[SEPP Comment: Four AP1000 reactors are being built in the US and four in China. It would be interesting to compare time to complete and costs, should they ever become available.]*

## **More on Radiation**

By Donn Dears, Power for USA, Nov 26, 2013

<http://dddusmma.wordpress.com/2013/11/26/more-on-radiation/>

## **Reviving Yucca Mountain**

The US nuclear regulator has directed its staff to complete work on the safety evaluation report (SER) for the Yucca Mountain geologic repository. Meanwhile, a court has awarded over \$235 million of damages to three utilities affected by federal failure to fulfil used fuel disposal commitments.

By Staff Writers, WNN, Nov 19, 2013

<http://www.world-nuclear-news.org/WR-Reviving-Yucca-Mountain-1911137.html>

## ***Health, Energy, and Climate***

### **UK sees steep increase in winter deaths**

By Emily Cadman, Financial Times, Nov 26, 2013

<http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/763fcb26-5681-11e3-ab12-00144feabdc0.html?siteedition=intl#ixzz2lkjeEOGt>

*[SEPP Comment: Since 1970, overall, winter deaths are generally down, but with an increase over the past few years. The deaths are generally linked to strokes, heart and respiratory diseases.]*

## ***Environmental Industry***

### **Why greens love high fuel bills**

By James Heartfield, Spiked, Nov 25, 2013 [H/t GWPF]

[http://www.spiked-online.com/newsite/article/why\\_greens\\_love\\_high\\_fuel\\_bills/14333#.UpTPL8SbPT9](http://www.spiked-online.com/newsite/article/why_greens_love_high_fuel_bills/14333#.UpTPL8SbPT9)

## ***Other Scientific News***

### **Biodiversity higher in the tropics, but species more likely to arise at higher latitudes**

By Staff WritersDurham NC (SPX) Nov 26, 2013

[http://www.terraviva.com/reports/Biodiversity\\_higher\\_in\\_the\\_tropics\\_but\\_species\\_more\\_likely\\_to\\_arise\\_at\\_higher\\_latitudes\\_999.html](http://www.terraviva.com/reports/Biodiversity_higher_in_the_tropics_but_species_more_likely_to_arise_at_higher_latitudes_999.html)

Link to paper: "Environmental harshness is positively correlated with intraspecific divergence in mammals and birds."

By Botero, Dor, McCain and Safran, Molecular Ecology, Oct 28, 2013

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/mec.12572/abstract>

*[SEPP Comment: Will global warming cause less species diversity?]*

### **Science self-corrects: bogus study claiming Roundup tolerant GMO corn causes cancer to be retracted**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 28, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/28/science-self-corrects-bogus-study-claiming-roundup-tolerant-gmo-corn-causes-cancer-to-be-retracted/>

## ***Other News that May Be of Interest***

### **Japanese firm plans 250 mile-wide solar panel belt around Moon**

A Japanese firm announces its innovative solution to the nation's energy problems - a 250 mile-wide belt of solar panels on the moon

By Julian Ryall, Telegraph, UK, Nov 28, 2013

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/japan/10480950/Japanese-firm-plans-250-mile-wide-solar-panel-belt-around-Moon.html>

[SEPP Comment: *Imagine the comments from the greens for such a plan!*]

#####

### **BELOW THE BOTTOM LINE:**

**Are the 'climate will affect sports stadiums' claims of U.S. Senator Sheldon Whitehouse the dumbest ever?**

By Anthony Watts, WUWT, Nov 24, 2013

<http://wattsupwiththat.com/2013/11/24/are-the-climate-will-affect-sports-stadiums-claims-of-u-s-senator-sheldon-whitehouse-the-dumbest-ever/>

[SEPP Comment: *Maybe not! See link below.*]

### **Hiroshima, global warming, and wakalixes**

By Luboš Motl, Reference Frame, Nov 26, 2013

<http://motls.blogspot.com/2013/11/hiroshima-global-warming-and-wakalixes.html>

#####

### **ARTICLES:**

#### **1. New Zealand Court Rejects 'Climate Change' Refugee**

Justice Calls Pacific Islander's Claim 'Novel' but Insufficient

By Lucy Craymer, WSJ, Nov 26, 2013

<http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579221030617117194>

WELLINGTON, New Zealand—A Pacific Island man seeking residency in New Zealand as a climate-change refugee is to be deported after the country's High Court rejected his claim.

The 37-year-old man, Ioane Teitiota, from the tiny Pacific nation of Kiribati had claimed refugee status in New Zealand on grounds that global warming has made it too dangerous to return to his homeland.

However, the High Court agreed with an earlier decision from New Zealand's immigration tribunal that the man be must returned to Kiribati as his plight did not qualify him as a refugee. The judgment was published Tuesday after a court hearing in Auckland on Oct. 16.

In his ruling, Justice John Priestley described Mr. Teitiota's claim as "novel," but added it was insufficient to allow him to change well-established law and provide him with an opportunity to remain in New Zealand.

Mr. Teitiota will be deported to Kiribati unless he appeals the decision in a higher court in New Zealand. His lawyer couldn't be reached for comment.

Kiribati, composed mainly of a group of coral reefs near the Equator, is among the world's lowest-lying nations, with most of its mass just 1 or 2 meters above sea level.

Worries over the impact of rising sea levels prompted the Kiribati government to buy 6,000 acres of land in neighboring Fiji this year to grow food and potentially resettle some of its 100,000 people if the country were to become uninhabitable.

In September, the United Nations reiterated in a landmark report that "warming of the climate system is unequivocal," saying that air and oceans are getting warmer, ice and snow are less

plentiful and sea levels are rising. New Zealand has made tackling climate change an environmental priority, and rolled out an emissions-trading program in 2011

\*\*\*\*\*

## **2. Wind Power Is Brought to Justice**

Duke Energy's guilty plea for killing protected birds is an ominous sign for renewable energy

By Robert Bryce, WSJ, Nov 28, 2013

[http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579218260583305226?mod=WSJ\\_Opinion\\_LEFTTopOpinion](http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052702304465604579218260583305226?mod=WSJ_Opinion_LEFTTopOpinion)

*[SEPP Comment: When discussing cash payments to wind farms, the timing of the payment is when it is placed in service, rather than at the start of the project. Thus, even though starts were down significantly in 2013, payments were high.]*

The Justice Department announced late last week that a subsidiary of Duke Energy DUK -0.67% has agreed to pay \$1 million for killing golden eagles and other federally protected birds at two of the company's wind projects in Wyoming. The guilty plea was a long-overdue victory for the rule of law and a sign that green energy might be going out of vogue.

As Justice noted in its news release, this is the first time a case has been brought against a wind company for violating the Migratory Bird Treaty Act. The 1918 law makes it a federal crime to kill any bird of more than 1,000 different species. Over the past few decades, federal authorities have brought hundreds of cases against oil and gas companies for killing birds, while the wind industry has enjoyed a de facto exemption. By bringing criminal charges against Duke for killing 14 golden eagles and 149 other protected birds, Justice has ended the legal double standard on enforcement.

While it is heartening to see the Obama administration finally following the law, Justice's decision might also indicate that the green bubble is about to burst.

Consider data from the American Wind Energy Association, an industry group. In 2012, when federal subsidies were flowing, wind companies installed a record 13,131 megawatts of new capacity—about 6,500 turbines. But installations have tanked this year amid uncertainty over the extension of the federal production tax credit, which offers companies a hefty 2.3 cent per kilowatt-hour subsidy. During the first three quarters of 2013, the domestic wind industry installed a mere 70.6 megawatts of new capacity. Wind-industry lobbyists are desperately trying to get the production tax credit extended again before it expires at the end of the year. The Duke case won't endear them to the public.

The renewable-energy craze may also lose its lustre as the public discovers how expensive "green jobs" are. Texas is the top wind-energy state in the nation. But in January Texas Comptroller Susan Combs reported that each wind-related job in the Lone Star State is costing taxpayers \$1.75 million.

There is also a public backlash against ruining scenic countryside with giant wind turbines. The outrage spans from the United Kingdom to Wisconsin. Last year, to cite just one example, about five dozen landowners in Herkimer County, New York filed a lawsuit against the owners of the Hardscrabble Wind Power Project. Their many complaints included reduced property values and excessive noise. To judge from news reports, suburban and rural residents don't want 130-meter-tall windmills in their neighborhoods. They also don't want the constant noise the turbines produce, or the relentless blink of the turbines' red lights all night, every night.

Definitive proof that the green energy bubble has burst will come when the government brings more legal action against renewable companies for violating U.S. law. That may be happening: The Fish and Wildlife Service has 18 active investigations into bird kills at various wind-energy projects. Seven have been referred to Justice for prosecution.

And it may not be limited to wind energy. Last week, Chris Clarke of the California public television station KCET reported that the Ivanpah Solar Electric Generating System, a new solar-thermal plant in the Mojave Desert, killed 52 birds in October. Many of the birds were apparently killed by the intense heat generated by the project's mirrors. It appears that the project is attracting birds, which means the deaths may increase when the facility reaches capacity. Mr. Clarke went on to opine that the solar-thermal projects now being built in the California desert "could well depress bird populations from the Arctic to the Panama Canal."

Apologists for wind and solar power insist that wind turbines only kill a few birds while climate change is the real threat. Last month, in a letter to The Wall Street Journal, an official from the American Wind Energy Association said that wind energy "enables the U.S. to develop a diverse energy portfolio better equipped to fight climate change—the number one threat to wildlife, according to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service."

Perhaps that's true. But everyone is threatened when the law is not applied equally, and so the Justice Department should continue ruffling the feathers of lawbreakers in the green-energy business.

*Mr. Bryce is a senior fellow at the Manhattan Institute. His new book, "Smaller Faster Lighter Denser Cheaper: Innovating toward a Greener, Richer World" (PublicAffairs), will be published in May.*

#####